

ASSOCIATION BETWEEN MIGRANT PROSTITUTION, TRAFFICKING IN WOMEN AND SERIOUS CRIME IN TURKEY

Türkiye’de Fuhuşa Karışan Göçmen Kadınlar, Kadın Ticareti ve Diğer Ağır Suçlar Arasındaki İlişki

Önder Karakuş *

Edmund F. McGarrell **

Abstract

The communities and crime research literature suggests a positive relationship between signs of social disorder (such as prostitution) and more serious crime, which might also include human trafficking. More specifically, whereas prostitution and other forms of disorderly conduct are presumed to undermine social cohesion in the community, the resulting tolerance for disorder is expected to attract outside trouble makers as a signal of increased opportunity for delinquent or criminal behavior. Driven by previous research on social disorder and more serious crime, this study explored the association between migrant prostitution and human trafficking and other forms of violent and property crime across 81 cities in Turkey. Significant differences between the cities with and without migrant prostitution are found with regard to their serious crime rates including the incidents of human trafficking. Implications for future research as well as suggestions for law enforcement strategies from a problem solving perspective are discussed.

Keywords: Prostitution, social disorder, human trafficking, crime analysis.

Özet

Toplum ve suç literatürü sosyal düzensizlik ve ciddi suçlar arasında pozitif bir ilişki öngörmektedir. İnsan ticareti de söz konusu ciddi suçlardan kabul edilebilir. Şöyle ki, fuhuş ve benzeri sosyal düzensizlik unsurları bir taraftan toplumdaki sosyal bütünlüğü ve dayanışmayı

* Ph. D., Kahramanmaraş Police Department, Turkey, karakusonder@yahoo.com

** Professor, School of Criminal Justice, Michigan State University, mcgarrel@msu.edu



azaltırken, diğer yandan suça meyilli kişilerin suç işleme olanaklarını artırır. Daha önce sosyal düzensizlik ve ciddi suçlar arasındaki ilişkiyi inceleyen araştırmalardan esinlenerek hazırlanan bu çalışmada, Türkiye genelinde 81 ilde meydana gelen (göçmen kadınların karıştığı) fuhuş olayları ile insan ticareti ve şahsa ve mala karşı işlenen suçlar arasındaki ilişki incelenmiştir. Bu çalışmada, fuhuşun yoğun olarak bulunduğu ve hiç bulunmadığı iller arasında insan ticareti oranları ve diğer suç oranları açısından anlamlı farklılıkların bulunduğu gözlenmiştir. Bu çalışmanın ileride yapılacak çalışmalara katkılar sağlayacağı ve prolem çözmeye kanun uygulayıcılarına önemli desteğinin olacağı değerlendirilmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Fuhuş, sosyal düzensizlik, insan ticareti, suç analizi.

Introduction

Human trafficking has emerged as a global concern within the last decade because of its human rights implications, its impact across national borders, and its challenges traditional criminological theory and public policy. Given the clandestine nature of the activities of smuggling and trafficking, it is not possible to measure the magnitude of the problem with a certain level of accuracy. According to the U.S. Fifth Annual Trafficking in Persons Report, between 600,000 and 800,000 women, men, and children are trafficked across international borders each year. Moreover, women and girls, half of whom are minors, constitute 80 percent of those trafficked persons (U.S. Department of State, 2005). The United Nations, on the other hand, placed the number of men, women, and girls trafficked across the international borders between 700,000 and 4 million in 2000. More recently, estimates range as high as over 27 million people to have been trafficked and exploited across international borders (Bales, 2005: 6). The forms of exploitation mainly include: slavery, forced labor or services, prostitution, and servitude (Granville, 2004). As for trafficking in women, it is not limited to exploitation within the sex industry since it also includes other forms of exploitation such as bonded labor, domestic service and even involuntary organ transplants (Kelly, 2002).

Until the end of the 1980s, it was primarily Asian women from Thailand and the Philippines who were subject to human trafficking (Stoecker & Shelley, 2005). However, with the collapse of the USSR, the former Soviet Union (FSU) countries/republics have become the major countries of origin for women trafficked into sex industries across the globe (Hughes, 2002). Basically, the process of post-Soviet socio-economic transition to market economies was particularly traumatic for women. That is to say, females were at an extremely precarious position since they were deprived of their jobs and were also suffering

from a collapsed welfare system (Stoecker & Shelley, 2005; Haynes, 2004). Thus, trafficking in human beings for sexual and labor exploitation in Europe has been driven mainly by the collapse of the Soviet Union in the late 1980s (IOM, 2002). Additionally, the conflicts in the former Yugoslavia contributed to the same process. Until the arrival of peace keeping missions in Kosovo, the Albanian mafia was used to abduct or lure young women to Italy and other parts of Europe and force them to work in brothels (Aronowitz, 2001).

In general, 90 percent of trafficking victims in the EU are claimed to originate from Central and Eastern European countries, with Ukraine, Hungary, Czech Republic, Bulgaria, Poland, Romania, Russia, and Albania mentioned among the main countries that contribute to the human trafficking into the EU (Mameli, 2002). According to a report from the United Nations Center for International Crime Prevention, Germany is the top destination of the women trafficked from Russia, and the United States is the second top destination. Cyprus and Turkey are emerging as European destination and transit countries (Hughes, 2002). In addition to Russia, Ukraine, Thailand, Nigeria, Moldova, Romania, Albania, China, Belarus, and Bulgaria are indicated as main countries of origin in the same report (Mizus, Moody, Privado & Dougla, 2003).

Currently, Russian women are known to have been involved in prostitution in over 50 countries as a result of trafficking (Hughes, 2000) and, trafficking in women is claimed to be the third largest profit for organized/transnational crime groups after drugs and arms (Kelly, 2002). In this regard, although trafficking in persons is probably the most serious human rights violation, it also seems to be the fastest growing business of organized crime. More specifically, trafficking in women for the purposes of sexual exploitation is one of the most prolific areas of international criminal activity (Miko, 2004). According to the U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation, human trafficking produced an estimated \$9.5 billion of (illegal) revenue annually (U.S. Department of State, 2005) and the value of the global trade in women for exploitation in the sex industries is estimated to be between \$7 and \$12 billion (Tomasi, 2000; Hughes, 2000). Moreover, the sex industry is claimed to be profitable for the local economy since it generates needs for secondary services and inputs ranging from food and clothing to condoms and health services. However, huge amount of profits generated out of that illicit market are rarely invested in the countries of origin; in contrast, they are transferred out of the country and laundered into western economies (Hughes, 2000).

Despite growing concern and increasing research on human trafficking within the last decade (Laczko, 2005), there are considerable methodological weaknesses in the current research (Kelly 2005). Existing research on human trafficking mostly estimates the scale of the problem; maps routes and countries of origin, transit, and destinations; or reviews legal frameworks and policy responses. Even though available research on human trafficking has developed information on the individual characteristics of traffickers, their victims, and the operational and structural features of the trafficking networks, there remains a dearth of reliable information about the characteristics of the victims and perpetrators as well as



about the distribution of trafficking markets across regions and within countries (Gozdziak, 2005). Moreover, whereas considerable research has focused on countries of origin, research on destinations of trafficking markets, where exploitation of the victims takes place, still remains underinvestigated. As such, legal regulations and intervention policies based on such limited research and information may create unintended side effects (Salt, 2000) and put the trafficked persons in a vicious cycle of exploitation. To contribute to efforts aimed at developing better prevention, prosecution, and protection measures, this study will view human trafficking as another type of serious (violent) crime. Borrowing from communities and crime research literature, human trafficking in women for the purposes of sexual exploitation in Turkey is hypothesized to be driven by the demand for the illegal services of trafficking markets which thrive upon existing social disorder in a given community.

1. Current Models of Human Trafficking

Until recently, two main overlapping theoretical models have been developed (without making a clear distinction between trafficking and smuggling) to explain human trafficking (Salt, 2000). Relying on an economic approach, the first model emphasizes trafficking as a business within the broader activity of migration. The second approach takes a legalistic view by considering trafficking as a criminal activity. For the former, Salt and Stein (1997) provide a hypothetical model that presents trafficking networks as intermediary systems in the global migration, which facilitate the movement between origin and destination countries.

The legalistic approach complements the former one in that it assumes the involvement of (organized) criminal networks as traffickers are involved in recruiting, transporting, or exploiting trafficked persons. Yet, there is an ongoing debate regarding the nature, structure and the role of such organized criminal networks within human trafficking (Finckenauer, 2001; Bruinsma & Bernansko, 2004; Levitsky, 2003). This debate reflects the disagreement on the definition of organized crime as either organized (Schelling, 1971) or disorganized (Reuter, 1983). Without resolving the debate, an alternative perspective focuses on the local, regional, and international variations in organized crime networks or syndicates (Levi, 1998; McIlwain, 1999; Allum & Sands, 2004; Shelley, 2003; Zhang & Chin, 2002).

There is, however, agreement that current international trade in human beings is perpetrated by traffickers composed of individuals or gangs of individuals (Stoecker, 2000). Prostitution and human trafficking are new and prolific businesses for pimps and organized crime groups across the world (O'Neil, 1999). Although it is possible for an individual pimp to get a woman into another country for the purpose of prostitution, if a large number of women are needed for a prostitution operation, an organized way of transportation involving false documents and corrupt officials appears especially necessary in sending countries (Hughes, 2002). In this regard, the size and the scope of trafficking can range from individual pimping and control of local women to loosely associated crime groups that focus on different aspects of the trafficking process, to major criminal syndicates with international

connections for trafficking women to destination countries where they control the sex industry. Unfortunately, trafficking is believed to be perpetrated by a large number of loosely connected crime groups that makes the detection and prosecution relatively difficult. Therefore, deterrence oriented policy applied to human trafficking is likely to only have limited impact given the cross-border operations of trafficking markets and their loosely coupled structure that undermine the power of national and international regulations and their enforcement.

2. Social Disorder, Human Trafficking, and Crime

The suggested disorder model, however, focuses on the social context where trafficking (recruitment and transportation as well as exploitation; see the UN definition of Human trafficking, 2000) takes place. In general, disorder refers to violation of norms regarding public behavior and is comprised of two dimensions: Social and physical. "Social disorder is a matter of behavior: you can see it happen (public drinking, or prostitution), experience it (catcalling or sexual harassment), or notice direct evidence of it (graffiti, or vandalism). Physical disorder involves visual signs of negligence and unchecked decay: abandoned or ill-kept buildings, broken streetlights, trash-filled lots, and alleys strewn with garbage and alive with rats" (Skogan, 1990: 4).

Although some researchers do not make a distinction between crime and disorder (Sampson and Raudenbush, 2001: 2; Garafalo and Laub, 1978) but rather argue that both have a common origin, others suggest that disorder needs to be distinguished from more serious crime problems that face communities (Skogan, 1990; Wilson and Kelling, 1982). Using aggregated indicators based on citizen perceptions of disorder and crime, Taylor et al. (1998) reported that (physical and social) disorder is distinct from community structure and community crime rates at neighborhood level. Analyzing individual perceptions of disorder and personal victimization of 13,918 people from 12 U.S. cities, Worrall (2006) also indicated that disorder represents a construct different from the estimate of crime, though not all of the disorder measures enjoyed discriminant validity.

According to Wilson and Kelling's "Broken Windows" (1982; see also Kelling and Coles, 1996) thesis, however, disorder and crime are usually inextricably linked in a kind of developmental sequence at the community level. Unchecked rule breaking, Wilson and Kelling argued, undermines community social control and gives rise to serious crime. Prevailing disorder in the neighborhood leads law-abiding residents to think that nobody in the neighborhood cares about what is going on in their environment and this makes them withdraw from public life as they assume that the neighborhood is disorganized and not safe (Lewis and Salem, 1986; McGarrell, Giomazzi, & Thurman, 1997). Once the residents withdraw from public life, they become less motivated to intervene to address physical and social disorder and such ongoing tolerance for disorder attracts outside trouble makers as a signal of increased opportunity for delinquent behavior.



Using perceived measures of robbery victimization and physical and social disorder, Skogan (1990) provided an empirical test of Wilson and Kelling's "Broken Windows" thesis based on a survey of 13,000 residents in 40 neighborhoods of six different cities in the U.S. Based on the analysis of the robbery victimization in 30 of the neighborhoods, Skogan (1990) concluded that crime, fear, and disorder were linked in a series of reciprocal relationships and that disorder preceded crime. Skogan (1990) prioritized neighborhood change as the main focus of interest and demonstrated the independent impact of disorder on neighborhood deterioration and decline. Similar to Wilson and Kelling's (1982) argument about withdrawal from the community life, Skogan (1990) also pointed to physical and psychological withdrawal from the neighborhood as a consequence of ongoing disorder and crime. On the one hand, personal physical moves from the community negatively influence the housing market and high levels of crime and disorder prevent investment in the neighborhood. Psychological isolation, on the other hand, undermines mutual responsibility among the residents, weakens informal social control, reduces participation in neighborhood affairs, and thus foreshadows a general decline in the community's organizational and political capacity (p.13). Overall, visible social disorder, including drug dealing, prostitution, and sexually-oriented enterprises, provides direct behavioral evidence of community social disorganization and these processes feed upon themselves, with fear, disorder and crime contributing to the further deterioration of local housing and business conditions (Taylor, 1995).

Despite a considerable number of studies based on perceptive and/or objective (i.e., observation; Taylor, 2001) measures of social and physical disorder, only a limited number of studies have looked at the relationship between official measures of disorder and crime. In fact, Weisburd and Green-Mazerolle (2000) have conducted one of the few studies that focused on the relationship between officially recorded indicators of disorder and crime. They investigated the relationship between street level drug hot spots, crime and disorder problems in Jersey City, New Jersey. This exploratory study demonstrated that street level drug hotspot activity, crime, and disorder problems cluster in certain areas of the city and these areas characterized by drug hotspot activity had a disproportionate share of crime and disorder problems compared to non-drug hotspot areas. Despite the lack of controls for alternative explanations, this descriptive analysis of drug hotspots supports the idea of a spatial association between disorder (illegal drug market activity) and serious crime based on official data and deserves further investigation.

Overall, using perceptive, objective, and official measures of disorder and crime, empirical research has provided substantial evidence on the spatial concentration of (physical and social) disorder and crime at different levels of analysis. Yet, few studies have considered whether disorder and crime are associated with migrant prostitution. Based on the theory and research described above, one could hypothesize that tolerance for immigrant prostitution in a given community, which might also be considered as demand for sexual

services, will attract human trafficking and contribute to more serious crime and in a community.

3. Migrant Prostitution, Human Trafficking and other Serious Crime

Skogan's (1990) research in forty neighborhoods across six different U.S. cities indicated that as a sign of both social and physical disorder, prostitution is likely to be linked to more serious crime in the community. In this regard, considering the strong link between prostitution and human trafficking (Ekberg, 2004; Schauer and Wheaton, 2006; Hughes, 2002; Davis, 2000; Farley and Barkan, 1998; Thukral, 2005) in terms of involved risks, the services both offer, and the people they benefit (males-johns, pimps, traffickers); an existing demand and tolerance for prostitution might be more likely to give rise to human trafficking in the community. Moreover, former victims' involvement in the victimization of others in order to avoid reprisals from the traffickers may also fuel the continuance of human trafficking in that community (Altink, 1995).

Put differently, to the extent that prostitution concentrates in locales characterized by a lack of social control, prostitution, like other indicators of social and physical disorder, should also relate to the variation of human trafficking and other serious crime across time and place. Since the traffickers are assumed to select their destinations through market testing and to establish their businesses where the reaction from the public and law enforcement is relatively weak (Kelly 2002; Straubhaar et al, 2004), prevailing social disorder would provide a conducive context for trafficking situations, for the communities with social disorder would be least able to resist the establishment and diffusion of illegal (trafficking) markets.

Motivated offenders are also attracted to disorderly areas because of the opportunities they offer (Wilson and Kelling, 1982; Skogan, 1990; Eck, 1995). In the case of sexual exploitation of trafficking victims, both traffickers and customers of their services and all other elements of the human trafficking market in that community (i.e., place managers) will be free of informal social control and the regulative capacity of a more orderly neighborhood. Consistent with this thesis, Simon and Gagnon (1973) found that many men are more likely to buy sex when social control over them is loosened (i.e., away from home). Browning and Wilbon (2003) also found that short term sexual partnering practices were more likely to occur among the people living in disorganized neighborhoods because of either weak social ties or of strong social ties with weak collective efficacy. As for human trafficking, Leuchtag (1995) contends that the women are sold or rented to affluent men who use anonymity to buy sex. Furthermore, it is also argued that if local small prostitution rings become connected to larger organized crime groups they can also serve as an entrance point for organized crime into that city or country since trafficking in women is claimed to be intertwined with other related criminal activities (O'Neill, 1999; Raymond and Hughes, 2001; UNODC, 2006; Shelley, 2003; Hurriyet, 2007).



While social disorder and lack of social control in the community creates a conducive context for prostitution to flourish, normalization and legalization of prostitution in the community, Hughes (2001) argued, increases men's demand for such services. This demand, in turn, is met through increased recruitment of women and girls into prostitution which usually involves violence, deception or exploitation of those who suffer from poverty, unemployment, and prior victimization (Hughes, 2001). Put differently, trafficking in women for the purposes of sexual exploitation is driven by men's demand for their services and the demand is increased and normalized by the prevalence of prostitution in a given social context.

Current research on human trafficking by international migration scholars already indicated simultaneous emergence and continuance of migrant prostitution and human trafficking (for the purposes of sexual exploitation) in different parts of the world such as the U.S., Italy, Spain, Turkey, Greece, Central Asia, Norway, and Korea (Schauer and Wheaton, 2006; Agustin 2005; Kelly, 2005a; Fergus, 2005; Gulcur and Ilkcaracan, 2002; Erder and Kaska, 2003; Lazaridis, 2001; Brunovskis and Tyldum, 2004; Dong-Hoon, 2004). The U.S. government also insists that prostitution and human trafficking are inextricably linked by stating "where prostitution is legalized or tolerated, there is a greater demand for human trafficking victims and nearly always an increase in the number of women and children trafficked into commercial sex slavery" (U.S. TIPS, 2005: 19).

Exploring the results from two decades of legalization of brothel prostitution in the state of Victoria, Australia, Sullivan and Jeffrey (2002) concluded that although legalization was intended to minimize the harm in prostitution, related crimes, and to control the expansion of the industry, that conversely it caused an increase in trafficking of girls and women into Victoria to meet the increased demand within an expanding and profitable sex industry. Though the number of legal brothels was doubled following the legalization of prostitution in Victoria, there were three times as many illegal brothels as the legal ones. As regard to the functional characteristic of trafficking markets, the researchers asserted that traffickers seemed to operate where there are brothels to place their goods without fear and harassment. Thus, legalization is perceived by the traffickers as a signal that shows them where they can develop their business. Simply put "for trafficking to occur there must exist in the destination country an economic context in which enslaved workers can be exploited and a social context that allows treating human beings in this way" (Bales, 2005: 156).

Overall, as a sign of social disorder and increased demand, prostitution is likely to increase human trafficking in the community as much as it is likely to drive other violent and property crimes mainly because of the inability of the community to regulate and control the behavior of its residents and visitors. These socially disorganized contexts are likely to become known as "copping zones" where interested customers can shop for drugs, sex, gambling, and trade in stolen goods (Skogan, 1990). In such contexts, opportunities for crime emerge through the cash-based black market. Further, as traffickers are attracted to these locations along with other criminals, trafficked victims are also forced into other types

of crimes such as pick-pocketing, car theft, drug smuggling or begging besides prostitution, (Bales and Lize, 2005). Consequently, increased prostitution in the community is associated with increases in other types of crimes. For example, law enforcement officers in the city of Vyborg in St Petersburg indicated that as the city became a site for prostitution tourism for Finnish men, there was an increase in the robbery of Finnish men and murders among rival prostitution gangs (Hughes, 2002).

Even in the case of legal prostitution, the lack of social control could lead to exploitation of prostituted women as much as it could lead to other violent and property crimes. Of 854 people (in prostitution) surveyed in a study of prostitution in nine different countries including Canada, Colombia, Germany, Mexico, South Africa, Turkey, United States, and Zambia; 71 percent were exposed to physical assaults in prostitution and 62 percent reported rapes in prostitution. Moreover, 59 percent of the women working in legal brothels of Germany indicated that legal prostitution did not make them any safer from rape and physical assault (Farley et al., 2003). Nevada, which is the only U.S. state with legal prostitution (in 13 of its counties), also had significantly higher rates of sex crimes than all other states in the U.S. in 1990s (Albert, 2001).

4. The Relationship between Migrant Prostitution, Human Trafficking, and other Serious Crime in Turkey

Although empirical research on human trafficking in Turkey is still sparse (IOM 2001), based on the individual testimonies of trafficking victims, Turkey is already characterized as both a transit and destination country for women primarily trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation from the former Soviet Union (FSU) countries, specifically from Moldova, Ukraine, Russia, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Belarus, Uzbekistan, and Romania (U.S., 2005; IOM, 2001a; Olimova & Bosc, 2003; ICMC, 2003; IOM, 2001b; Hughes, 2002; Kelly, 2005). According to statistics provided by Turkish National Police (Table 1), 94 percent of the victims identified between 2003 and 2005 were from these countries and all trafficking victims were exclusively females trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

Following the collapse of USSR, Turkey's liberal border policies led to an influx of regular and irregular migrants from the FSU countries who were mainly irregular migrants, refugees, transit migrants and circular or shuttle migrants in the form of mostly suitcase traders¹ (Erder & Kaska, 2003). Increased transnational commerce in the form of suitcase trade and the unprecedented flow of women from the FSU to Turkey, however, were accom-

¹ Also known as *shuttle traders*, *suitcase traders* are generally the women who arrive in Turkey with limited amount of money to buy goods from local merchants and then return to their own countries to sell these products. They also sell other merchandise in Turkey which they bring from their own countries. These women are generally known as *suitcase traders* in Turkey, for they generally transport their goods in suitcases or plastic bags (Gulcur & Ilkcaracan, 2002: 413).

panied by the involvement of the FSU women in prostitution in the provinces frequented by shuttle traders such as Istanbul and Trabzon. The former Soviet Union countries account for almost 75 percent of the deportations because of sexually transmitted diseases (STD) and involvement in prostitution (Table 2).

Table 1. Number of Victims of Human Trafficking by Country of Origin in Turkey, 2003-2005

| Nationality | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 | Total | % |
|--------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|-------------|
| Azerbaijan | - | 23 | 13 | 36 | 6.03 |
| Belarus | - | 3 | 6 | 9 | 1.50 |
| Bulgaria | - | - | 1 | 1 | .17 |
| Armenia | - | - | 1 | 1 | .17 |
| Georgia | 5 | 16 | 7 | 28 | 4.70 |
| Iran | - | 1 | - | 1 | .17 |
| Turkey | 4* | - | - | 4 | .67 |
| Iraq | 1 | - | - | 1 | .17 |
| Kazakhstan | - | 9 | 8 | 17 | 2.85 |
| Kyrgyzstan | 6 | 19 | 22 | 47 | 7.87 |
| Moldova | 41 | 62 | 66 | 169 | 28.31 |
| Uzbekistan | 2 | 5 | 10 | 17 | 2.85 |
| Romania | 8 | 11 | 11 | 30 | 5.02 |
| Russia | 13 | 61 | 26 | 100 | 16.75 |
| Turkmenistan | - | 3 | 6 | 9 | 1.50 |
| Uganda | - | - | 1 | 1 | .17 |
| Ukraine | 22 | 26 | 78 | 126 | 21.10 |
| TOTAL | 102 | 239 | 256 | 597 | 100% |

Source: TNP; *These four victims are also former FSU citizens who gained citizenship through marriage.

As soon as the FSU women lost their purchasing power and started to become involved in lucrative tourism and entertainment business, they were lured or forced into prostitution (Hann & Hann, 1992), for they lacked legal working opportunities (Erder & Kasaka, 2003) and protection and thus were vulnerable to exploitation because of their illegal working conditions in Turkey. Although the shuttle trade² and prostitution claimed to be two separate activities with separate participants (Yukseker, 2004), it was common to hear the

² See footnote 1.

women who preferred to be involved in prostitution, even though they had the opportunity to be involved in the suitcase industry or other work, claim that they involved in prostitution due to the money available in the sex industry (Gulcur & Ilkcaracan, 2002: 415). It didn't take long for those women to be constructed as "Natashas" which simply resulted in the objectification of the women from the FSU republics as prostitutes.

Table 2. Deportation of Persons Who are from the Former Soviet Republics, 1996-2005

| | STD | | | | | | Prostitution | | | | | |
|---------------|------|------|------|------|-------|-------------|--------------|------|------|------|-------|-------------|
| | 1996 | 1997 | 2001 | 2005 | Total | % | 1996 | 1997 | 2001 | 2005 | Total | % |
| Russia | 92 | 38 | 120 | 53 | 303 | 8% | 408 | 417 | 495 | 347 | 1667 | 13% |
| Kazakhstan | 9 | 1 | 15 | 14 | 39 | 1% | 15 | 20 | 23 | 24 | 82 | 1% |
| Kyrgyzstan | 1 | 0 | 11 | 52 | 64 | 2% | 3 | 0 | 25 | 154 | 182 | 1% |
| Tajikistan | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% |
| Turkmenistan | 0 | 0 | 0 | 43 | 43 | 1% | 4 | 0 | 1 | 70 | 75 | 1% |
| Uzbekistan | 4 | 1 | 61 | 54 | 120 | 3% | 10 | 1 | 119 | 66 | 196 | 2% |
| Armenia | 14 | 38 | 14 | 5 | 71 | 2% | 31 | 26 | 40 | 35 | 132 | 1% |
| Azerbaijan | 140 | 124 | 165 | 45 | 474 | 12% | 207 | 271 | 530 | 150 | 1158 | 9% |
| Georgia | 406 | 375 | 150 | 32 | 963 | 24% | 559 | 522 | 663 | 155 | 1899 | 15% |
| Belarus | 0 | 0 | 7 | 13 | 20 | 0% | 0 | 0 | 13 | 22 | 35 | 0% |
| Moldova | 52 | 31 | 209 | 131 | 423 | 11% | 187 | 602 | 729 | 405 | 1923 | 15% |
| Ukraine | 48 | 34 | 210 | 111 | 403 | 10% | 214 | 726 | 662 | 415 | 2017 | 16% |
| Estonia | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% |
| Latvia | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0% |
| Lithuania | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 2 | 0% | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0% |
| FSU | 766 | 643 | 963 | 553 | 2925 | 73% | 1640 | 2585 | 3300 | 1843 | 9368 | 73% |
| Others | 468 | 264 | 290 | 77 | 1099 | 27% | 1429 | 1498 | 208 | 270 | 3405 | 27% |
| TOTAL | 1234 | 907 | 1253 | 630 | 4024 | 100% | 3069 | 4083 | 3508 | 2113 | 12773 | 100% |

Source: TNP

Despite the picture of Turkey as an emerging destination site for human trafficking and migrant prostitution, governmental reports suggested that immigrant women are not prostituted and victimized all around Turkey but rather only in certain cities. Based on social disorganization theory we would expect their victimization and/or offending experiences to differ as a function of the ability of a given city/district/neighborhood to regulate its residents' and visitors' behaviors to attain the common goal of living in an environment free from the threat of crime. If we think of existing prostitution as a proxy measure for prevailing social disorder, as suggested by the disorder model, then we would expect cities with more incidents of migrant prostitution to have more human trafficking and other serious crime. Simply



put, the more the number of the FSU women are involved in prostitution in a Turkish community, the more likely we are to come across cases of human trafficking and other serious crime in that specific community.

Consequently, in this study we were interested in whether there exists an association between migrant prostitution, human trafficking, and crime at the city level. Specifically, do Turkish cities experiencing higher levels of crime and migrant prostitution also experience higher levels of human trafficking?

5. Methodology

5.1. Data and Measurement

Turkey is comprised of 81 provinces and has a national police organization serving each of the 81 cities with a provincial head quarter and personnel. The Turkish National Police (TNP) produces statistics for terror related, drug related, organized crime, and for what is called “public order” crime. Similar to the index crimes in the United States, public order crimes include both violent crimes of murder, rape, robbery and aggravated assault; and the property crimes of burglary, larceny, and motor vehicle theft. Crime statistics regarding the distribution of human trafficking markets and property and violent crimes as well as prostitution related deportations of foreigners across the 81 cities were retrieved from annual crime statistics produced by TNP. Accordingly, no sampling strategy has been employed as all 81 cities are included in this study.

Human trafficking is operationalized as the number of human trafficking incidents (Htincident) in a city in the year 2004 from data provided by the police. Another measure of human trafficking, “human trafficking rate” (Htrate) is also calculated by standardizing the number of human trafficking incidents by the population of each city (per 100,000 population). To measure violent and property crime rates, several types of crime rates in the year 2003 (per 100,000 population) have been utilized including homicide, assault, robbery, burglary, and auto theft. Public order crime rate is considered as a measure of the total/overall crime rate in the year 2003 (Tcrime). Finally, the police provided number of prostitution related deportations has been used as a measure of existing migrant prostitution and thus of social disorder in a city in the year 2003 (Migpros). More specifically, given that migrant prostitution, like human trafficking, is also peculiar to certain cities in Turkey, the cities with one or more prostitution related deportation(s) in the year 2003 have been coded as 1 whereas all other cities with no prostitution related deportations have been coded as 0.

6. Analysis

In order to test the hypothesized relationship between migrant prostitution, human trafficking, and other serious crime across 81 cities in Turkey, both univariate and bivariate analyses have been conducted. As is clear from the summary statistics provided below (Table 3), the distribution of both migrant prostitution and human trafficking is quite skewed because of inflated zero cases. In fact, there were no cases of human trafficking in 50 cities (62%) and only 1 case in 20 others (25%) in 2004. In other words, only 11 cities (13%) had more than

one human trafficking case in the entire year. As for migrant prostitution, in 2003, 33 (41%) cities reported no prostitution related deportation, whereas 8 (10%) cities reported only one prostitution related deportation and the remaining 40 (49%) cities had two or more prostitution related deportations in the entire year. Overall, 33 cities with no reported deportation of women (because of involvement in prostitution) have been coded as '0' indicating the absence of illegal migrant prostitution in these cities. The remaining 48 cities, on the other hand, have been coded as '1' and regarded as having some level of immigrant prostitution in Turkey.

Table 3. Crime Rates per 100,000 Population

| | Minimum | Maximum | Mean | Std.Dev. |
|--|---------|---------|--------|----------|
| Homicide | .00 | 5.73 | 1.80 | 1.16 |
| Assault | 3.60 | 74.54 | 26.20 | 13.40 |
| Robbery | .00 | 18.08 | 3.87 | 3.25 |
| Burglary | 17.99 | 484.61 | 97.21 | 94.61 |
| Autotheft | .00 | 166.34 | 10.31 | 19.65 |
| Total Crime Rate (Tcrime) | 77.01 | 852.86 | 352.10 | 171.76 |
| Human Trafficking rate (Htrate) | .00 | 2.77 | .16 | .43 |
| Migrant Prostitution (Migpros)* | .00 | 432.00 | 21.91 | 68.94 |
| Human Trafficking incidents (Htincident) | .00 | 27.00 | 1.52 | 4.48 |

Source: TNP; * The number of women deported because of involvement in prostitution

As an initial step in the analysis, the distribution of crime rates across the 48 cities with incidents of migrant prostitution (Migpros=1) was compared to the 33 cities without migrant prostitution (Migpros=0; see Table 4). The patterns were clear and consistent. Overall, the rate of total crime (Tcrime) was twice as high in the 48 cities with migrant prostitution. Specifically, there were almost twice as many as homicide, robbery, and burglary incidents per 100,000 population committed in the cities with migrant prostitution compared to the cities without migrant prostitution. The rate of auto theft incidents committed in cities with migrant prostitution was almost four times greater than it was in the cities without migrant prostitution. The cities with migrant prostitution also had twice as many assaults. Human trafficking incidents, consistent with crime patterns, appeared to be concentrated in the cities with migrant prostitution as the total human trafficking rate in these cities was more than 25 times the total human trafficking rate in cities without migrant prostitution. Indeed, 97 percent of human trafficking incidents (per 100,000 population) in 2004 occurred in the cities that reported migrant prostitution in the year 2003.

Table 4. Distribution of Total Crime Rates by Migrant Prostitution in Turkey

| | Migpros=0 (N=33) | Migpros=1 (N=48) |
|-----------|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| Homicide | 44.20 (30%) | 101.50 (70%) |
| Assault | 717.49 (34%) | 1 404.47 (66%) |
| Robbery | 87.82 (28%) | 225.67 (72%) |
| Burglary | 2119.74 (27%) | 5754.54 (73%) |
| Autotheft | 160.50 (19%) | 674.32 (81%) |
| Tcrime | 9405.90 (33%) | 19114.39 (67%) |
| Htrate | .52 (4%) | 12.89 (96%) |

The clustering of serious crimes in the cities with migrant prostitution implies a positive relationship between tolerance and demand for migrant prostitution and serious crime in particular cities in Turkey. In order to further test this relationship, an independent samples t test was conducted to investigate the impact of migrant prostitution on the distribution of serious crime in Turkey. As hypothesized, the t test revealed (Table 5) a statistically significant difference between the average serious crime rates in the cities with and without migrant prostitution. On average, the cities with migrant prostitution appear to have significantly more incidents of serious crime across all different types of crime ranging from homicides to human trafficking.

Table 5. Independent-Samples t Test for the Distribution of Serious Crime Rates by Migrant Prostitution in Turkey

| | Mean | | Standard Error | “t” |
|-----------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|------------|
| | Migpros=0 (N=33) | Migpros=1 (N=48) | | |
| Homicide | 1.34 | 2.11 | .25 | 3.114*** |
| Assault | 21.74 | 29.26 | 2.93 | 2.566** |
| Robbery | 2.66 | 4.70 | .64 | 3.202*** |
| Burglary | 64.23 | 119.89 | 17.62 | 3.160*** |
| Autotheft | 4.86 | 15.05 | 3.65 | 2.516* |
| Tcrime | 285.02 | 398.21 | 33.84 | 3.344*** |
| Htrate | 0.02 | .27 | .08 | 3.197*** |

$N=81$, *** $p < .005$, ** $p < .01$, * $p < .05$ (Two-Tailed).

The average crime rate for each type of crime in the cities with migrant prostitution was also higher than the national average for that specific type of crime. The average

homicide rate in the cities with migrant prostitution was 17 percent greater than would be expected if crime were spread evenly across the country. The average assault rate in the cities with migrant prostitution was almost 12 percent higher and the average robbery rate in the cities with migrant prostitution was 21 percent greater than the country average. Similarly, burglary rates in the cities with migrant prostitution were 23 percent higher than average burglary rate across all the cities in Turkey. The average autotheft rate in the cities with migrant prostitution was 45 percent greater than its country-level average. The overall/total crime rate was also concentrated in the cities with migrant prostitution as average total crime rate in these cities was 13 percent greater than would be expected if crime were spread evenly across the cities in Turkey. Finally, average human trafficking rate in the cities with migrant prostitution were 10 percent greater than average human trafficking rate across the country.

Thus, guided by communities and crime research literature, the distribution of serious crime rates across the cities with and without immigrant prostitution and the results of related independent samples t test lend support for the premised relationship between migrant prostitution-as a sign of social disorder- and serious crime.

7. Discussion, Limitations and Implications

The results indicate a clear relationship at the city level between rates of migrant prostitution, crime, and human trafficking. This suggests that geographic patterns of human trafficking fit theoretical patterns consistent with the crime and disorder framework. Although the data and design employed in this study cannot test the relationship, the results are consistent with a theory-based model that predicts that the local community conditions that generate high rates of crime and disorder will also be conducive to human trafficking. Further, we would predict that these relationships will be reinforcing with crime and disorder attracting prostitution and human trafficking and with prostitution and trafficking reinforcing disorder, fear and crime. Having said this, there are several methodological concerns that need to be addressed in advance:

First, we recognize that the concentration of serious crime in the cities with migrant prostitution and human trafficking does not prove a causal link between migrant prostitution, human trafficking and serious crime, though this cross-sectional analysis of this spatial relationship in Turkey indicated a significant relationship between them. Although we measured migrant prostitution and crime at time one (2003), and human trafficking at time two (2004), we also recognize that choosing to measure trafficking at time one and crime and prostitution at time two would also likely yield such correlations. As stated above, it is likely that these conditions are reciprocal and that community conditions conducive to prostitution

and crime are also conducive to human trafficking. Clearly, more research on the causal order of these relationships is warranted.

Second, it is virtually certain that the measurement of human trafficking is underreported in these data. This is true for all crime data but particularly so for crimes such as prostitution and trafficking where victims are unlikely to report to the police. The issue for the present analysis is whether there is systematic bias generated by differing levels of reporting across the 81 cities of Turkey. The fact that these data are collected by a national police agency (TNP) utilizing common reporting practices makes this somewhat less problematic than in a country with a decentralized policing structure (e.g., U.S.) but it remains a threat to the patterns observed herein.

With these qualifications in mind, it is interesting to consider whether the patterns between crime and human trafficking are so highly correlated that we are merely observing coterminous effects. That is, crime, prostitution and human trafficking are all part of a single construct and thus the observed associations do not explain anything. In this context, the concentration of increased crime rates in the cities with migrant prostitution might be considered as a result of uneven distribution of serious crime across the cities. Examination of the data at regional level (including 12 different regions of Turkey), however, does not support this argument. Simply put, there are high crime cities in each region both with and without migrant prostitution. The cities with the highest overall crime rates in the regions of Central Anatolia and Central East Anatolia, for example, do not have migrant prostitution. The West Black Sea region, as another example, accounts for the highest overall crime rate (13.2%) in Turkey and there are 10 cities in the region. Yet, only 3 out of 10 cities in this region have migrant prostitution whereas the remaining 7 cities do not. The South East Anatolia region, on the other hand, accounts for the 10.2 percent of overall crime rate in Turkey and the region comprises 9 cities. Despite the presence of relatively higher overall crime rate in the region, like the West Black Sea region, only limited number of cities (2) has migrant prostitution in this region. Finally, in the Central East Anatolia region, 3 out of 8 cities have migrant prostitution. Even though cities with migrant prostitution are underrepresented in this region, these cities account for almost 60 percent of overall crime rate in the region. Thus, rather than uneven distribution of migrant prostitution markets and of serious crime across the cities and regions, clustering of serious crime in the cities with migrant prostitution is revealed.

Fourth, since the current study solely focuses on the spatial link between migrant prostitution and serious crime across the cities, we acknowledge that certain ecological characteristics of the cities might also compound the impact of migrant prostitution, and thus, social disorder on higher serious crime rates. More specifically, as suggested by communities and crime research literature, certain structural characteristics (e.g., racial/ethnic

heterogeneity, concentrated disadvantage, mobility) of a given community can attenuate the community's ability to regulate the behaviors of its residents and visitors and thus increase social disorder. Therefore, future research should also take into consideration possible impact of structural characteristics of the cities as well (See Bursik and Grasmick, 1993).

Finally, our analysis is at the city level. The communities and crime literature suggests that the real variation in terms of structural characteristics, crime, disorder, fear, and formal and informal social control, is at the neighborhood and even block level (Bursik and Grasmick, 1993; Taylor, 2000). Thus, an extension of this research should move to the neighborhood and block level of analysis to truly test the relationship between disorder, crime, and human trafficking.

These methodological reservations aside, our findings have important policy implications for police crime prevention strategies targeting human trafficking and other serious crime:

First of all, this analysis suggests that human trafficking follows patterns similar to other forms of crime and disorder. Specifically, human trafficking clusters with migrant prostitution and other serious crime cluster in certain cities in Turkey. Given these clusters, our findings support a problem oriented approach which prioritizes the control of opportunities that create deviant places and situations (Green, 1996; Mazerolle and Ransley, 2006). More specifically, focusing on cities with migrant prostitution, Turkish National Police can identify specific situations and micro places that facilitate migrant prostitution and human trafficking and allocate resources for prevention efforts accordingly. Additionally, given the significant spatial link between migrant prostitution and other serious crimes, a problem oriented approach focusing on cities with migrant prostitution is also expected to help the TNP to address other serious criminal and disorderly behavior in these cities. Similarly, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) concerned with responding to the needs of victims of human trafficking can concentrate their efforts in locales likely to have clusters of victims.

However, problem oriented policing requires more than just reacting to ongoing incidents of crime to control opportunities that create deviant places and situations. In fact, despite the TNP's substantial efforts targeting trafficking in women across the country since the early 2000s, the stable number of human trafficking (Table 1) victims in Turkey in recent years might also indicate the limited impact of such traditional reactive approaches in tackling human trafficking. Problem oriented policing, on the other hand, involves an opportunity blocking process that requires a variety of problem solving strategies such as allocating economic and political resources (to elicit help from government and private sector services), mobilizing communities, and using civil law remedies (Goldstein, 1990; Mazerolle & Ransley, 2006). One of the most significant tools utilized in this process is enforcement of civil code violations to encourage or coerce non-offending third party persons (i.e., property



owners, place managers, and others who have stakes in the routine activities of targeted places) to take more responsibility for eradicating disorder and crime problems in their environment (Green, 1996).

In this regard, an alternative problem solution approach to migrant prostitution, human trafficking, and other serious crimes also necessitates a reform in traditional reactive policing philosophy. Without ignoring the importance of traditional strategies (i.e., when they are relevant for a specific problem), problem oriented policing require police officials to become 'problem managers' (Green, 1996; Mazerolle & Ransley, 2006; McGarrell, Giacomazzi, and Thurman, 1999) and lead the community into the right direction while tackling the issues of crime and disorder. Past research already indicated that police efforts targeting disorderly behavior in high crime communities can result in reduction in more serious crime (Kelling and Coles, 1996; Skogan, 1990; Rosenfeld et al., 2006; Messner et al., 2006). Police interventions targeting migrant prostitution and human trafficking, thus, can borrow from previous research conducted on the relationship between social disorder and serious crime.

Third, a significant spatial link between migrant prostitution, human trafficking and serious crime (i.e., in Turkey) underlies the importance of formal and informal control of prostitution and thus contrasts with radical feminist arguments rejecting a dual (volunteered/forced) conceptualization of prostitution in the name of emancipation of the women as free sex workers (Kempadoo and Doezema, 1998; Naggle, 1997; Doezema, 1998; Chapkis, 1997). That is not to say that problem oriented approach would prioritize a simple dichotomy of abolishment or regulation of prostitution. Yet, given empirical findings supporting an existing link between prostitution and prevailing tolerance for prostitution (Cohen, 1980) and association between migrant prostitution and human trafficking (Ekberg, 2004; Schauer and Wheaton, 2006; Hughes, 2002; Davis, 2000; Farley and Barkan, 1998; Thukral, 2005), formal control can contribute to community based efforts by indicating an existing political will and determination reflected in the formal intervention of police (also see Silver and Miller, 2004 and McGarrell, Giacomazzi, and Thurman, 1997 for positive relationship between satisfaction of police services and informal social control). Moreover, when prostitution is legal, Hughes and Denisova (2001) argued, the dilemma of voluntary versus forced prostitution creates problems in terms of prosecution of the traffickers as law enforcement is expected to prove that the women did not consent.

Conclusion

From the early days of the Chicago School of Criminology (Shaw and McKay, 1972), the link between a variety of social problems, disorder, and crime has been observed at the com-

munity level. This research suggests that human trafficking, at least at the city level, follows a similar pattern. Further, the link between disorder and more serious crime, and specifically the relationship between migrant prostitution, human trafficking, and other serious crime in Turkey, calls for an extended problem solving approach including formal and informal interventions that range from the allocation of necessary resources and implementation of criminal and civil laws to collaboration with place managers and owners as well as the mobilization of the local residents. Communities and crime research has already pointed to successful results in terms of the prevention of disorder, including both drugs and prostitution (Weisburd et al, 2006; Eck, 1995; McGarrell, Giacomazzi, and Thurman, 1999) and also demonstrated diffusion of the crime control benefits without displacement (Weisburd and Green, 1995; Braga et al., 1999). Despite the limits of the present research and the need to extend this research (e.g., to other countries and to the neighborhood and block level), these results suggest that communities and crime research has applicability to the global and local issue of human trafficking.

References

- Agustin, L. (2005). Migrants in the mistress's house: other voices in the "trafficking" debate. *Social Politics*, 12(1), 96–117.
- Albert, A. (2001). *Brothel: Mustang Ranch and its women*. New York: Random House.
- Allum, F., & Sands, J. (2004). Explaining organized crime in Europe: Are economics always right?. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 41, 133-160.
- Altink, S. (1995). *Stolen Lives: Trading Women into Sex and Slavery*. London: Scarlet Press.
- Aronowitz, A.A. (2001). Smuggling and trafficking in human beings: The phenomenon, the markets that drive it and the organizations that promote it. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 1(2), 163-195.
- Bales, K. (2005). *Understanding global slavery*. Berkeley: University of California press.
- Bales, K., & Lize, S. (2005). Trafficking in persons in the United States: A report to the National Institute of Justice. Croft Institute for International Studies, University of Mississippi. Retrieved September 23, 2006, from www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/211980.pdf.
- Braga, A.A., Weisburd, D.L., Waring, E.J., Mazerolle, L.G, Spelman, W., Gajewski, F. (1999). "Problem oriented policing in violent crime places: A randomized controlled experiment", *Criminology*, 37 (3), 541-580.
- Browning C.R., & Wilbon, M.O. (2003). Neighborhood structure, social disorganization, and number of short-term sexual partnerships. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 65, 730-745.
-



- Bruinsma, G., & Bernasco, W. (2004). Criminal groups and transnational illegal markets. *Crime, Law & Social Change*, 41, 79-94.
- Brunovskis, A., & Tyldum, G. (2004). Crossing Borders: An Empirical Study of Trans-national Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings (Rep. No. 426). Norway: Fafo. Retrieved November 17, 2005, from <http://www.fafo.no/pub/rapp/426/426.pdf>.
- Chapkis, W. (1997). *Live sex acts: Performing erotic labor*, NY:Routledge.
- Davis, N.J. (2000). From victims to survivors: Working with recovering street prostitutes. In Weitzer, R. (Ed), *Sex for sale: Prostitution, pornography, and the sex industry* (pp.139-159). NY: Routledge.
- Doezema, Jo (1998) 'Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary v. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy', pp. 34–51 in K. Kempadoo and J. Doezema (eds) *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance and Redefinition*. London: Routledge.
- Dong-Hoon, S. (2004). International sex trafficking in women in Korea: Its causes, consequences and countermeasures, *AJWS*, 10 (2), 7-47.
- Eck, J.E. (1995). A general model of the geography of illicit retail marketplaces. In J. E. Eck & D. Weisburd (Eds.), *Crime and Place* (Vol.4- pp.67-95). Monsey, New York: Criminal Justice Press.
- Ekberg, G. (2004). The Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services: Best practices for prevention of prostitution and trafficking in human beings. *Violence Against Women*, 10, 1187-1218.
- Erder S., & Kaska S., (2003). *Irregular Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of Turkey*. Geneva: IOM.
- Farley, M., Cotton, A., Lynne, J., Zumbek, S., Spiwak, F., Reyes, M. E., Alvarez, D., & Sezgin, V. (2003). Prostitution in nine countries: Update on violence and posttraumatic stress disorder. In Farley, M. (Ed.), *Prostitution, trafficking, and traumatic stress*, Binghamton, NY: Haworth, pp. 33-74.
- Farley, M., & Barkan, H. (1998). Prostitution, violence and posttraumatic stress disorder. *Women and Health*, 27(3), 37-49.
- Fergus, L. (2005). *Trafficking in women for sexual exploitation* (Briefing No:5). Australian Institute of Family Studies: Commonwealth of Australia. Retrieved August 12, 2005, from http://www.aifs.gov.au/acssa/pubs/briefing/acssa_briefing5.pdf.
- Finckenauer, J.O. (2001). Russian Transnational Organized Crime. In D. Kyle & R.Koslowski (Eds.), *Global Human Smuggling: Comparative Perspectives* (pp.166-187). Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Garofalo, J., & Laub, J. (1978). The fear of crime: Broadening our perspective. *Victimology*, 3, 242–253.

- Goldstein, H. (1990). *Problem-Oriented Policing*, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Gozdziak, E. M., & Collett, E. A. (2005). Research on human trafficking in North America: A review of literature. *International Migration*, 43(1-2), 99-128.
- Granville, J., (2004). From Russia without love: The “Fourth Wave” of global human trafficking. *Demokratizatsiya*, 12(1), 147-155.
- Green, L. (1996). *Policing Places with Drug Problems*, Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- Gulcur, L., & Ilkcaracan, P., (2002). The Natasha Experience: Migrant sex workers from the former Soviet Union and Eastern Europe. *Women’s Studies International Forum*, Vol. 25(4), 411 - 421.
- Hann, C. and Hann, I. (1992). “Semovars and Sex on Turkey’s Russian Markets”, *Anthropology Today*, (8)4, 3-6.
- Haynes, F.H. (2004). Used, abused, arrested, and deported: Extending immigration benefits to protect the victims of trafficking and to secure the prosecution of traffickers. *Human Rights Quarterly*, 26 (2), 221-272.
- Hughes, M D., & Denisova, T.A. (2001). The Transnational Political Criminal Nexus of Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. *Trends in Organized Crime*, 6, 43-67.
- Hughes, M.D. (2000). The “Natasha” trade: The transnational shadow market of trafficking in women, *Journal of International Affairs*, 53(2), 625.
- Hughes, M.D. (2001). The ‘Natasha’ trade: Transnational sex trafficking. *National Institute of Justice Journal*, 246, 8-16.
- Hughes, M.D. (2002). *Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation*. Geneva : IOM.
- Hurriyet. (2007). *Samsun’da fuhus operasyonu: 29 gozalti*. Retrieved June 5, 2007, from <http://hurarsiv.hurriyet.com.tr/goster/haber.aspx?id=6651852>.
- ICMC, (2003). Regional Clearing Point: First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe. Retrieved from www.icmc.net/pdf/first_annual_report03.pdf on 2/27/2006.
- IOM, (2001). Hardship abroad or hunger at home: A study of irregular migration from Georgia, IOM: Georgia.
- IOM (2001a). Trafficking in women and children from the republic of Armenia: A study, IOM: Yerevan.
- IOM (2002). *Trafficking in Migrants*. Quarterly Bulletin, Special Issue, No:26.
- IOM, (2001b). Away from Azerbaijan, destination Europe: Study of migration motives, routes and methods, IOM: Geneva.



- Kelling, G., & Coles, C.M. (1996). *Fixing broken windows: Restoring and reducing crime in our communities*. NY: Free Press.
- Kelly, L. (2005). You can find anything you want: A critical reflection on research on trafficking in persons within and into Europe. *International Migration*, 43 (1/2), 235-266.
- Kelly, L. (2005a). *Fertile Fields: Trafficking in persons in Central Asia*. IOM: Vienna. Retrieved February 10, 2006, from http://tcc.iom.int/iom/images/uploads/IOM-%20Fertile%20Fields,%20Trafficking%20in%20Persons%20in%20Central%20Asia,%202005_1128609474.pdf.
- Kelly, L., (2002). *Journeys of jeopardy: A Review of Research on Trafficking in Women and Children in Europe*. UK: Child and Women Abuse Studies Unit, University of North London. Retrieved December 17, 2005, from http://www.old.iom.int/documents/publication/en/mrs_11_2002.pdf.
- Kempadoo, K., Doezema, J. (1998). *Global sex workers: Rights, resistance, and redefinition*, Routledge: New York, 29-34.
- Laczko, F. (2005). *Data and research on human trafficking: A global survey*. IOM: Geneva.
- Lazaridis, G. (2001). Trafficking and prostitution: The growing exploitation of migrant women in Greece. *The European Journal of Women's Studies*, 8(1), 67-102.
- Leuchtag, A. (1995). Merchants of flesh: International prostitution and the war on women's rights. *The Humanist*, 55(2), 11-16.
- Levi, M., (1998). Perspectives on organized crime: An overview. *The Howard Journal*, 37(4), 335-345.
- Levitsky, M. (2003). Transnational Criminal Networks and International Security. *Syracuse Journal of International Law and Commerce*, 30(2), 227-240.
- Lewis, D.A., & Salem, G. (1986). *Fear of Crime: Incivility and the Production of a Social Problem*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Books.
- Mameli, P.A. (2002). Stopping the illegal trafficking of human beings. *Crime Law and Social Change*, 38(1), 67-80.
- Mazerolle, L., & Ransley, J.(2006). The case for third-party policing. In Weisburd, D. & Braga,A.A. (Eds.), *Police innovation: Contrasting perspectives*, New York: Cambridge University Press.
- McGarrell, E. F., Giacomazzi, A. L., & Thurman, Q. C. (1997). Neighborhood disorder, integration, and the fear of crime. *Justice Quarterly*, 14(3),479-500.
- McGarrell, E. F., Giacomazzi, A., & Thurman, Q. (1999). Reducing disorder, fear, and crime in public housing: A case study of place specific crime prevention, *Journal of Criminal Justice Research and Policy*, (1)2, 61-87.

- McIllwain, S.J. (1999). Organized Crime: A social network approach. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 32(4), 301-323.
- Messner, S.F., Galea, S., Tardiff, K.J., Tracy, M., Bucciarelli, A., Piper, T.M., Frye, V., Vlahov, D.(2007). Policing, Drugs, and the homicide decline in New York city in the 1990s. *Criminology*, 45(2), 385-414.
- Miko, F.T. (2004). *Trafficking in Women and Children: The U.S. and International Response*. CRS Report for Congress. Retrieved June 7, 2006, from <http://fpc.state.gov/documents/organization/31990.pdf>.
- Mizus, M., Moody M., Privado, C., & Dougla, C. A. (2003). Germany, US receive most sex-trafficked women, *Off Our Backs*, 33(7/8), 4.
- Naggle, J.(1997). *Whores and other feminists*, London: Routledge.
- O'Neill, A.R. (1999). *International trafficking in Women to the United States: A contemporary manifestation of slavery and organized crime*. An intelligence monograph. Retrieved July 17, 2005, from <https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/books-and-monographs/trafficking.pdf>.
- Olimova, S., Bosc, I. (2003). Labor migration from Tajikistan, IOM: Dushanbe.
- Raymond, J., & Hughes, M.D. (2001). *Sex trafficking of women in the United States: International and domestic trends* (monograph). Washington, DC: Coalition Against Trafficking in Women.
- Reuter, P. (1983). *Disorganized Crime: The Economics of the Visible Hand*. London: MIT Press.
- Rosenfeld, R., Fornango, R., & Rengifo, A.F.(2007). The impact of order-maintenance policing on New York city homicide and robbery rates. *Criminology*, 45(2), 355-384.
- Salt, J. (2000). Trafficking and Human Smuggling: A European Perspective. *International Migration*, 38(3), 31-56.
- Salt, J., & Stein, J. (1997). Migration as a business: the case of trafficking. *International Migration*, 35(4), 467-494.
- Sampson, R. J., & Raudenbush, S. W. (2001). *Disorder in urban neighborhoods—Does it lead to crime?* Washington, DC: National Institute of Justice (NCJ Publication No. 186149).
- Schauer, E.J., & Wheaton, E.M. (2006). Sex trafficking in the United States: A literature review. *Criminal Justice Review*, 31(2), 146-169.
- Schelling, T.C. (1971). What is the Business of organized crime?. *Journal of Public Law*, 20, 71-84.
- Shaw, C. R., McKay, H.D (1972). *Juvenile delinquency and urban areas*, Third Edition, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.



- Shelley, I.L. (2003). Trafficking in women: The business model approach. *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, 10 (1), 119-131.
- Silver, E., Miller, L.L.(2004). "Sources of informal social control in Chicago Neighborhoods", *Criminology*, 42 (3), 551-583.
- Simon, W., & Gagnon, J. (1973). *Sexual conduct*. Chicago: Markham Publishing.
- Skogan, W. (1990). *Disorder and decline: Crime and the spiral of decay in American neighborhoods*. Berkeley, CA: University of CA Press.
- Stoecker S., & Shelley L., (2005). *Human trafficking and transnational crime: Eurasian and American perspectives*. Lanham, Boulder, New York, Toronto, Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Stoecker, S. (2000). The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime. *Demokratizatsiya*, 8 , 129-131.
- Straubhaar, T., Mayer, O.G., Hefeker, C., Lammers, K., & Wohlers, E. (2004). *EU-Enlargement, migration and trafficking in women: The case of South Eastern Europe*. HWWA-Report (Rep. No.247). Hamburg Institute of International Economics.
- Sullivan, M.L., & Jeffreys, S. (2002). Legalization: The Australian experience. *Violence Against Women*, 8(9), 1140-1148.
- Taylor , R.B. (2000). *Breaking away from broken windows: Baltimore neighborhoods and the nationwide fight against crime, guns, fear, and decline*. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Taylor, R.B, Bazemore, G., Boland, B., Clear, T.R., Corbett, R.P., Feinblatt, J., Berman, G., Sviridoff, M., & Stone, C.(1998). Crime and place: Plenary papers of the 1997 conference on criminal justice research and evaluation, NCJ, 168618, 1-22.
- Taylor, R.B. (1995). The Impact of Crime on Communities. *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 539, 28-45.
- Thukral, J. (2005). *Behind closed doors: An analysis of indoor sex work in New York City*. *SIECUS Report*, 33(2), 3-9.
- Tomasi L.F. (2000). Globalization and human trafficking. *Migration World Magazine*, 28(4), 4.
- United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime-UNODC.(2006). *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*, Anti-Human Trafficking Unit, United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC).
- United Nations,(2000). "United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially, Women and Children." United Nations, Geneva.
- United States Department of State. (2005). *Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act 2000: Trafficking in Persons Report 2005*, Department of State, Washington DC.
- Weisburd, D., & Green-Mazorelle, L. (2000). Crime and disorder in drug hot spots: implications for theory and practice in policing. *Police Quarterly*, 3(2),152-170.

- Weisburd, D., Green, L. (1995). "Measuring Immediate Spatial Displacement: Methodological Issues and Problems", in Eck J. E. and D. Weisburd, (Eds.), *Crime and Place*, Volume 4, Monsey, New York: Criminal Justice Press, pp. 349.
- Weisburd, D., Wyckoff, L., Ready, J., Eck, J.E., Hinkle, J.C., & Gajewski, F. (2006) Does Crime Just Move Around the Corner?: A Controlled Study of Spatial Displacement and Diffusion of Crime Control Benefits. *Criminology* 44(3), 549-591.
- Wilson, J.Q., & Kelling, G. (1982). Broken windows: the police and neighborhood safety. *Atlantic Monthly*, March: 29-38.
- Worrall, J.L. (2006). Does targeting minor offenses reduce serious crime? A provisional, affirmative answer based on an analysis of county level data. *Police Quarterly*, 9, 47-72.
- Zhang, S., & Chin, K. (2002). Enter the dragon: Inside Chinese human smuggling organizations. *Criminology*, 40(4), 737-767.
-